Good Practices Enough in Public Private Dialogue

Herzberg, Sisombat & PPD Team
Anna Kompanek, CIPE
World Bank Group
Development Challenge

Current State

“How?”

Desired State
The ‘How’ Really Does Matter

We plan for this...

Plan

But end up with....

Reality
**Current State**

- **Coalition Building**
  - Public Private Dialogue
- And collaborative leadership

**Desired State**

**“HOW?”**

### Investment climate / FDI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry focused - competitiveness</th>
<th>Youth programs / NGOs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>Youth Leadership, The Mandela Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>Youth Development Fund (YDF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>Youth Net, Youth Development Program (YDP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>Youth Voice, Youth Media Development Corps (YMDC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>Youth Entrepreneurs' Network (YEN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>Youth Development Network (YDN)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:**

- **Public Private Dialogue:**
  - **Current State:**
    - Investment climate / FDI
    - Industry focused - competitiveness
    - Youth programs / NGOs
  - **Desired State:**
    - Collaboration and collaborative leadership

**Image:**

- A young child in a muddy river setting.
**WHO IS IN THE ROOM?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economy-wide PPDs Investment Climate</th>
<th>Industry focused PPDs – Competitiveness Partnerships</th>
<th>Civil Society - Academia-Foundations – Think Tanks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Algeria</strong> Investment Climate National Committee (CNEA)</td>
<td><strong>Algeria</strong> - Automobile sector PPD</td>
<td>Youth Livelihoods, The <strong>MasterCard</strong> Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cameroon</strong> Business Forum (CBF)</td>
<td><strong>Algeria</strong> - Leather sector PPD</td>
<td>Partners for Good, <strong>Jordan</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ethiopia</strong> - Addis Ababa Chamber Of Commerce and Sectoral Associations</td>
<td><strong>Algeria</strong> - Agricultural sector PPD</td>
<td><strong>Jordan</strong> Al Quds Center for Political Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gabon</strong> High Council for Investment (HCI)</td>
<td><strong>Afghanistan</strong> – Public-Private Partnerships</td>
<td><strong>African</strong> Leadership University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Guinea</strong> Public-Private Dialogue (PPDC)</td>
<td><strong>Burundi</strong> Sectoral PPDs</td>
<td><strong>Morocco</strong> - Search for Common Ground</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Iran</strong> Public-Private Dialogue Council</td>
<td><strong>Bosnia-Herzegovina</strong> Sectoral PPDs</td>
<td><strong>Nigeria</strong> National Youth Coalition for Democracy (NYCD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Malawi</strong> Public-Private Dialogue</td>
<td><strong>Jordan</strong> Garment Sector Alliance</td>
<td><strong>USA</strong> - IREX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Moldova</strong> Prime Minister Economic Council</td>
<td><strong>Kyrgyz</strong> Republic Cluster-based PPD</td>
<td><strong>Uganda</strong> - Building A Network to Address Youth Unemployment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Morocco</strong> National Committee for Business Environment</td>
<td><strong>Mauritania</strong> Freezone Task Force</td>
<td><strong>USA</strong> - Education Development Center (EDC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nepal</strong> Federation of Woman Entrepreneurs' Associations</td>
<td><strong>Tunisia</strong> - Water PPD</td>
<td><strong>Development Partners / Implementation Agencies</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nigerian</strong> Economic Summit Group</td>
<td><strong>Tunisia</strong> - Pharmaceutical industry PPD</td>
<td>Confederation of Danish Industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Senegal</strong> Public-Private Dialogue</td>
<td><strong>Tunisia</strong> - Inter-agency platform for value chain development and competitiveness enhancement</td>
<td>The World Bank Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tunisia</strong> National Business Agenda</td>
<td>PPD on competitiveness reinforcement of the IT sector “Smart <strong>Tunisia</strong>”</td>
<td><strong>GIZ</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Turkey</strong> YOIKK</td>
<td></td>
<td>Center for International Private Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>NHO</strong>, Confederation of Norwegian Enterprise</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PPD CHARTER OF GOOD PRACTICE

PRINCIPLE I: CONTEXTUAL DESIGN
PRINCIPLE II: OPEN GOVERNANCE PROCESS
PRINCIPLE III: MANDATE AND INSTITUTIONAL ALIGNMENT
PRINCIPLE IV: STRUCTURE AND PARTICIPATION
PRINCIPLE V: FACILITATION
PRINCIPLE VI: CHAMPIONS
PRINCIPLE VII: OUTPUTS
PRINCIPLE VIII: OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS
PRINCIPLE IX: MONITORING & EVALUATION
PRINCIPLE X: APPROPRIATE AREA AND SCOPE
PRINCIPLE XI: CRISIS AND CONFLICT RESPONSE
PRINCIPLE XII: DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS
PRINCIPLE XIII: SUSTAINABILITY
**PRINCIPLE I: CONTEXTUAL DESIGN**

*PPD can take several forms and can take place at various levels within different timeframes.*

*Les PPD peuvent prendre plusieurs formes et peuvent avoir lieu à des niveaux avec des durées de vie divers.*
### PPD TYPOLOGY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National</th>
<th>Economy-wide</th>
<th>Permanent institution</th>
<th>Public-driven</th>
<th>3rd party brokerage/support</th>
<th>General orientations/ Many goals</th>
<th>Many actors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Area</td>
<td>Scope</td>
<td>Institutionalization</td>
<td>Leadership</td>
<td>Ownership</td>
<td>Focus</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Sector-specific</td>
<td>Temporary initiative</td>
<td>Private-driven</td>
<td>Locally driven/sustained</td>
<td>Specific changes / Specific goal</td>
<td>Few actors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Herzberg, World bank Group, 2013**
Typology of PPDs: 7 inter-locking types

- National
  - Economy-wide
  - Permanent institution
  - Public-driven
  - 3rd party brokerage/support
  - General orientations/ Many goals
  - Many actors

- Local
  - Sector-specific
  - Temporary initiative
  - Private-driven
  - Locally driven/sustained
  - Specific changes / Specific goal
  - Few actors

**PPD TYPOLOGY**

Herzberg, World Bank Group, 2013
LOTS OF CONSULTATIONS!

Source: Private Sector For Good Governance Program, 2001-2013 Program
PRINCIPLE II: OPEN GOVERNANCE PROCESS

PPD needs to function under open, transparent and fair governance rules. PPDs will be more likely to succeed if their governance structures are designed to best take into account political economy factors.

Les PPD doivent fonctionner selon des règles de gouvernance ouvertes, transparentes et équitables. Les PPD seront plus susceptibles de réussir si leurs structures de gouvernance sont conçues pour mieux tenir compte de l’économie politique.
PPD DESIGN PROCESS

1. Project brief
2. Sector constraints (Existing benchmarks and surveys)
3. Stakeholder investigation (Field interviews and focus groups)
4. Private sector
5. Intermediaries
6. Public authorities
7. Civil Society
8. Development partners
9. Most significant reforms (Field interviews and focus groups)
10. Stakeholder analysis
FILTERING PROCESS TO ENSURE TRANSPARENCY AND FAIRNESS

Specific reform proposals issued by individual, firm or entity

- First filter: Working group which has competency over the topic/region/sector
  - no: Proposal rejected
  - yes: Amendment requested

Second filter: Secretariat consider feasibility of proposal in given timeframe and mandate of the PPD

- no: Proposal rejected
- yes: Proposal forwarded to secretariat for processing

Third filter: International experts/development partners certify compliance with best practice

- no: Proposal rejected
- yes: Proposal reinforced by Working Group team of lawyer + economist. Proposal formatted and includes cost/benefit analysis

Fourth filter: Proposal put forward for vote by working groups heads

- no: Proposal rejected
- yes: Proposal put forth for plenary discussion between all working group heads under auspices of secretariat

Proposal accepted and put forth through government executive and legislative process

Source: PPD Handbook
PRINCIPLE III: MANDATE AND INSTITUTIONAL ALIGNMENT

A statement of objective is helpful for clarity. A formal or legal mandate can be an important help in some political and economic contexts, but mandates are never sufficient to establish good PPD. Wherever hosted and whenever possible, PPD should be aligned with existing institutions to maximize the institutional potential and minimize friction.

Une déclaration d'objectif est utile pour la clarté. Un mandat formel ou juridique peut être une aide importante dans certains contextes politiques et économiques, mais les mandats ne sont jamais suffisants pour établir un bon PPD. Où qu’il soit hébergé et dans la mesure du possible, le PPD devrait être aligné avec les institutions existantes afin de maximiser le potentiel institutionnel et de minimiser les frictions.
Source: Benin Investor Council, Private Sector Engagement for Good Governance, World Bank, 2012
LINKING THE PPD TO OTHER REFORMS PROCESSES

SEZ Clusters

Value chain

Regulatory simplification

Open governance initiatives (e.g. open budgets)

$17

RIA and regulation review process
## INSTITUTIONAL ALIGNMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possible host</th>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>President’s / Prime Minister’s Office</td>
<td>Top-level political backing and a remit that stretches across different government departments and agencies.</td>
<td>Risk of creating “turf war” antagonism with other government agencies. Risk of political over-reliance on the individual figure of the president or prime minister of the day. Risks being seen by private sector as a government mouthpiece rather than a genuinely neutral space for dialogue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Finance or Trade</td>
<td>Likely to offer the most direct access to relevant decision-makers.</td>
<td>Risks narrowness of view on activities that impinge on other departments or agencies. Risks being seen by private sector as a government mouthpiece rather than a genuinely neutral space for dialogue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment promotion agency or similar agency</td>
<td>Offers possibility of secretariat being hosted in an agency which already has a track record of promoting business climate improvements.</td>
<td>Vulnerable to weaknesses in agency such as ineffectiveness, narrowness of remit or negative perceptions on the part of some important stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chamber of Commerce or other BMO</td>
<td>Can ensure that a wide range of member businesses are aware of and have easy access to the secretariat, and build the capacity of the Chamber or BMO in other respects.</td>
<td>If there are several Chamber/BMOs, to locate the secretariat in one risks alienating the other. Risk of being seen by government as more of a private sector mouthpiece than neutral space for dialogue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International organization</td>
<td>Likely to have surest access to international best practice, trained personnel and funding. Can be perceived as a neutral, honest broker.</td>
<td>Risk of fostering dependence on external donors rather than local ownership of the dialogue process. Can be unhelpful for public image when donors and viewed negatively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New and independent institution</td>
<td>Best chance of being perceived by all stakeholders as a disinterested, neutral facilitator.</td>
<td>Need to start from scratch with no existing institutional strengths to take advantage of.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PPD Handbook
PRINCIPLE IV: STRUCTURE AND PARTICIPATION

PPD should have a solid structure and a representative participation. The structure should be manageable while flexible, enable participation to be both balanced and effective, reflect the local private sector context and stakeholders’ interests.

Le PPD devrait avoir une structure solide et une participation représentative. La structure devrait être gérable tout en étant flexible, permettre à la participation d’être à la fois équilibrée et efficace, refléter le contexte du secteur privé local et les intérêts des parties prenantes.
TYPICAL STRUCTURE

Public-Private Mandate

Steering Committee

Secretariat/coordination

Working group 1
Working group 2
Working group 3
Working group 4
Working group 5

Private sector advocates, associations, government representatives, donors

Source: PPD Handbook, 2011
Implementation Workgroup
Administrative coordination
Technicians
Regular meetings and reporting
Reporting to Head of Permanent Secretariat
Caraga is an administrative region of the Philippines, on the northeastern portion of the island of Mindanao. Rich in natural resources, it has great potential for development. It is characterized by a wood-based economy, extensive water resources and rich mineral deposits, such as iron, gold, silver, nickel, chromite, manganese and copper.

COMMUNITY-SPECIFIC

- Multi-stakeholder dialogues
- Participatory land use planning,
- Strengthening of community-based “wardens”
- Watershed protection in marginalized communities
- Reduction of violent conflicts on the use of these resources.
SECTOR-SPECIFIC

SALMON EXPORT FACILITY IN CHILE
Note: LP: Local Producers, FF: Foreign Firms, FG: cooperation from Foreign Government, M: Market, G: government, LG: Local Government, ASC: Industrial Association., Direction of influence are expressed in the following arrows:
Strong ➤ Weak ➤ Mutual collaboration
SECTOR-SPECIFIC

2001-onwards

Note: LP: Local Producers, FF: Foreign Firms, FG: cooperation from Foreign Government, M: Market, G: government, LG: Local Government, ASC: Industrial Association., Direction of influence are expressed in the following arrows: Strong ➔ Weak ➔ Mutual collaboration

26
PLEASE DRAW ME A PPD
S’IL VOUS PLAIT, DESSINEZ MOI UN PPD…
PPD NAME / NOM: ________________________________

Ministries/Ministeres?
PM Office / premature?
Presidency / Présidence?

Steering Committee (SC) / Conseil d'adm. (CA)

Secretariat

Working group / Groupe de travail 1, 2, 3, 4, etc.

Chair SC / President du CA

Companies / societes
government / gouvernement
Donors/Bailleurs Fonds
associations
Communities / Communautés
PRINCIPLE V: FACILITATION

The PPD process gains to be facilitated professionally with dedicated people and resources so as to efficiently manage all aspects of the dialogue process with a view to deliver results.

Le processus PPD gagne à être facilité professionnellement avec des personnes et des ressources dédiées afin de gérer efficacement tous les aspects du processus de dialogue en vue de produire des résultats.
Structured dialogue → Workable Projects → Projects that work

PPD contributes to all steps of project process

Diagnostic
- Engagement
- Definition
- Empowerment

Solution Design
- Consensus building
- Filtering

Implementation
- Ongoing support
- Watchdog
- Resources

Monitoring & Evaluation
- Watchdog
- Feedback loop

Source: Herzberg and Palmade, World Bank Group, 2006
### PPD: BUDGET PREVISIONNEL ANNUEL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Charges du Personnel</th>
<th>Soussous-Tribunal</th>
<th>Environnement</th>
<th>Structure</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Courant</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Salaires</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
<td>1,600,000</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
<td>600,000</td>
<td>600,000</td>
<td>600,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frais Transport/Carburant</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>60,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frais Tk.Cat.</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sécurité sociale</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total/Mois (Déficit)</td>
<td>8,400,000</td>
<td>8,400,000</td>
<td>8,400,000</td>
<td>8,400,000</td>
<td>8,400,000</td>
<td>8,400,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dépenses de Fonctionnement**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dépenses de Fonctionnement</th>
<th>Unité</th>
<th>Mille</th>
<th>Subtotal</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total $</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Administratif</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureautique</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing/Communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entretien équipements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Etudes et Recherches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Réunions Forum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frais déplacement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% Imprimus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S/Total fonctionnement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dépenses de Fournitures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fournitures de Fournitures</th>
<th>Unité</th>
<th>Mille</th>
<th>Subtotal</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total $</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Administrative</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureautique</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing/Communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entretien équipements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Etudes et Recherches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Réunions Forum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frais déplacement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% Imprimus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S/Total fonctionnement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAUX**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mille</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>140,781,600</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>281,563</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GOOD PLANNING

Bulldozer Committee
1st Plenary Session
Vetting 8 reforms

Bulldozer Committee
2nd Plenary Session
Vetting 15 reforms

Bulldozer Committee
3rd Plenary Session
Vetting 27 reforms

Bulldozer Committee
50 REFORMS
PUBLISHED
IN PRESS

BC presents
50 reforms to
CoM, RS, FBiH
in JOINT
GOVERNMENT
SESSION

BC presents
50 reforms to
CoM, RS, FBiH
in JOINT
GOVERNMENT
SESSION

Joint
Parliament
Meeting in
National
Theatre
with BC

HR Press Conf.
To Present BC
50 reforms

3 Govts
give their
amendments
package
to PAs
under
"urgent
procedure"

Source: Bosnia Herzegovina, Bulldozer Committee, 2011
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue No.</th>
<th>Name of working group</th>
<th>Issue name</th>
<th>Primary institution responsible for follow-up</th>
<th>Primary person responsible</th>
<th>IMPLEMENTATION STATUS</th>
<th>Date of Issue Closed</th>
<th>Benefits realized to private sector</th>
<th>Benefits realized to public sector</th>
<th>Comments on progress</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ - $ - $ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PRINCIPLE VI: CHAMPIONS

Leadership from a set of individuals or organizations is often necessary to reduce the trust gap, to sustain the energy and keep pushing for involvement of the parties over the long run.

Le leadership d'un ensemble de personnes ou d'organisations est souvent nécessaire pour réduire l'écart de confiance, pour maintenir l'énergie et encourager la participation des parties sur le long terme.
WHAT IS LEADERSHIP, WHO IS A CHAMPION?

Heroic vs. post heroic leadership
(Bradford & Cohen, 1998)

**Heroic Leadership**
- Traditional framework: Leader is responsible
  - Direction
  - Management Group
  - Downward influence
  - Leader creates

**Post-Heroic Leadership**
- New framework: Everyone is responsible
  - Tangible vision
  - Shared responsibility team
  - Mutual influence
  - Leader and members create
LEADERSHIP FOR PPD

- Mobilizing stakeholders to do adaptive work and create or enhance public value

- Mobilization implies to:
  - motivate,
  - organize,
  - orient and
  - focus attention.

(Heifetz, 1994)
SOCIAL FUNCTIONS OF AUTHORITY

1. Direction and sense of purpose
2. Protection
3. Order:
   i. Roles and responsibilities
   ii. Conflict resolution mechanism and cohesion
   iii. Norms

(Heifetz, 1994)
PRINCIPLE VII: OUTPUTS

Outputs can take the shape of structure and process outputs, analytical outputs, soft outputs or recommendations. While all should contribute to agreed private sector development outcomes, the PPD should aim for tangible, practical and measurable benefits.

Les extrants peuvent prendre la forme d’une meilleure structure ou des processus, des travaux analytiques, des résultats qualitatifs ou des recommandations. Bien que tous devraient contribuer à des résultats convenus pour le développement du secteur privé, le PPD devrait viser des avantages tangibles, pratiques et mesurables.
SEVERAL TYPES OF OUTPUTS

Focusing on this will bring the others

Source: PPD Handbook
# Action Plan: Template

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Milestone</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Point Person</th>
<th>Stakeholders</th>
<th>Timeframe</th>
<th>Indicative Budget</th>
<th>Monitor and Evaluate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EVIDENCE OF DEVELOPMENT EFFECTIVENESS

2005:
Independent evaluation of 5 Investors Advisory Councils in Africa

2007:
Independent evaluation of 3 Business Forums in Mekong

2009:
Independent evaluation of 30 WBG-sponsored PPD

2011:
Impact assessment of 4 IC country programs (Rwanda, Liberia, Sierra Leone, Burkina Faso)

2012:
IFC internal evaluation of IC programs and their development effectiveness

2012:
Impact of IC programs in Fragile and Conflict Affected States

Over 400 reforms achieved in over 50 distinct areas
Economic impact (private sector savings)
Conservative estimate: $500 millions
Cost effectiveness
Start-up investment of 100k-200k
PPD IMPACT ON ROAD REPAIR IN NOSY BE & FORT DAUPHIN

Source: Uy, 2011 (Madagascar Growth Pole project, FPD Africa, World Bank Group)
Enabling communication of a shared vision and understanding through the development of a common language is essential for building trust among stakeholders and keeping them engaged.

Permettre la communication d'une vision et d'une compréhension partagées grâce au développement d'une langue commune est essentiel pour renforcer la confiance entre les parties prenantes et les maintenir engagés.
Bosnia Bulldozer initiative, “50 reforms in 150 days”

From the Protocols for Prosperity... To the Prosperity Garden (Bosnia)

Cambodia SME credit reform – TV shows on location (SMEs) + Experts

Better Business Initiative
Partnering to improve the economic environment

Nigeria PPD

Georgia legal and judicial reform

Accountability gets specific in Bosnia (corporate governance reform)
Bangladesh Better Business Forum (BBBF)

Recommendation Implementation Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IMPLEMENTED</th>
<th>NOT APPROVED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

About the BBBF

The Bangladesh Better Business Forum (BBBF), the Bangladesh public-private sector forum in Bangladesh, began its journey in 2007 with the aim of improving the business environment in Bangladesh through interactions between the business community and government officials.

BBBF aims to create conditions favorable to the business environment that has been confronted with socio-economic challenges in recent years. The forum focuses on several dimensions of improving the business climate in Bangladesh. These include crafting an action plan on regulatory reforms relating to both incentives, developing skills of potential labor force, ensuring access to finance for businesses, starting up businesses and much more. More...

Key BBBF activities include:

- Promoting an effective public private dialogue to improve the business enabling environment.
- Removing barriers impeding business growth.
- Providing feedback to various government policies, laws, and regulations affecting the private sector.
PRINCIPLE IX: MONITORING & EVALUATION

Monitoring and evaluation is an effective tool to manage the public private dialogue process and to demonstrate its purpose, performance and impact.

Le suivi et l'évaluation sont un outil efficace pour gérer le processus de dialogue privé public et pour démontrer son but, sa performance et son impact.
TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES FOR MONITORING + EVALUATION
PRINCIPLE X: APPROPRIATE AREA AND SCOPE

The dialogue process should be tailored to the set of issues to be addressed and consider the implications for sub-issues that are part of a larger agenda and smaller jurisdictions which can play a role in the change process. Local and sector specific public private dialogues have strong potential for focused results. National and economy-wide platforms and local and sector specific initiatives would gain in coordinating their agendas so as to best serve the interests of their constituencies.

Le processus de dialogue devrait être adapté à l'ensemble des problèmes à aborder et tenir compte des implications pour les sous-questions qui font partie d'un programme plus large et de juridictions plus petites qui peuvent jouer un rôle dans le processus de changement. Les dialogues privés publics locaux et sectoriels ont un fort potentiel de résultats ciblés. Les plates-formes nationales et économiques et les initiatives locales et sectorielles gagneront à coordonner leurs programmes afin de mieux servir les intérêts de leurs groupes électoraux.
Rose Farming in Ethiopia

Call Centers in India

Asparagus Farming in Peru
WHAT ACTION ARE BEST FOR THE SECTOR?
For instance, is infrastructure important?

From a “welcome tent” for cruises at the beginning of the 1990’s...

Source: Duch, Competitiveness LLC, 2011
Comparison of 2 sectors in 5 countries (Egypt, Lebanon, Malta, Spain and Turkey) + Comparison of 10 different PPD case studies in one region of Spain - Catalonia

Source: Herzberg, Kassim, Majumdar, Sudan, Stanford University research team, Watson, Zeng, World Bank Group, 2011
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>Regulatory and tax</td>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Access to finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Public-Private</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Kassim and Herzberg, World Bank Group
PRINCIPLE XI: CRISIS AND CONFLICT RESPONSE

Public-private dialogue is particularly valuable in crisis, conflict and fragile environment to mitigate entrenched interests, rebuild trust and accelerate inclusive and sustainable growth. PPD mechanisms can also work towards resolving disputes and reconciling views of different stakeholders on particular issues.

Le dialogue public-privé est particulièrement précieux en situation de crise, de conflit et d'environnement fragile pour atténuer les intérêts enracinés, rétablir la confiance et accélérer une croissance inclusive et durable. Les mécanismes de PPD peuvent également s'efforcer de résoudre les différends et de concilier les opinions des différentes parties prenantes sur des questions particulières.
Greece during the economic crisis of 2007-09

Haiti unemployment rate rises from 70% pre-quake to 80% post-quake
PRINCIPLE XII: DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS

Public-private dialogue initiatives can benefit from the input and support of donors (development partners) when their role is determined by the local context, demand driven, and based on partnership, coordination and additionality.

Les initiatives de dialogue public-privé peuvent bénéficier de l'apport et du soutien des donateurs (partenaires au développement) lorsque leur rôle est déterminé par le contexte local, axé sur la demande et basé sur le partenariat, la coordination et l'additionnalité.
PRINCIPLE XIII: SUSTAINABILITY

“Sustainability” (or ‘Exit’) refers to the transfer of operations, management or financing of a PPD by a development partner to local institutions. Achieving sustainability is a challenge for PPDs and requires the commitment of all PPD actors.

«Durabilité» (ou «Sortie») désigne le transfert des opérations, la gestion ou le financement d'un PPD par un partenaire de développement aux institutions locales. Atteindre l’autonomie est un défi pour les PPD et nécessite l'engagement de tous les acteurs du PPD.
LIFE AND DEATH OF A PPD MECHANISM
PPD CHARTER OF GOOD PRACTICE

PRINCIPLE I: CONTEXTUAL DESIGN
PRINCIPLE II: OPEN GOVERNANCE PROCESS
PRINCIPLE III: MANDATE AND INSTITUTIONAL ALIGNMENT
PRINCIPLE IV: STRUCTURE AND PARTICIPATION
PRINCIPLE V: FACILITATION
PRINCIPLE VI: CHAMPIONS
PRINCIPLE VII: OUTPUTS
PRINCIPLE VIII: OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS
PRINCIPLE IX: MONITORING & EVALUATION
PRINCIPLE X: APPROPRIATE AREA AND SCOPE
PRINCIPLE XI: CRISIS AND CONFLICT RESPONSE
PRINCIPLE XII: DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS
PRINCIPLE XIII: SUSTAINABILITY
Tools for change - making Public-Private Dialogue work

KM Website
- Charter of good practice
- Lessons learned papers
- Interactive PPD handbook
- 80 case studies
- E-Learning
- Templates
- M&E Tools
- Workshop materials

Global Workshops

http://www.publicprivatedialogue.org
http://www.facebook.com/publicprivatedialogue
Twitter: @PPDialogue

Implementation guidelines

Diagnostic tool

M&E Tools for PPD secretariats
STILL A LOT TO LEARN

STILL A LOT TO FIGHT FOR

THANK YOU!

Lili Sisombat, Lsisombat@worldbank.org
Anna Kompanek, CIPE: akompanek@cipe.org